

Protected Areas and Human Well Being

Dan Brockington
University of Manchester

George Holmes
University of Leeds

Aims and objectives

Whilst protected areas expand worldwide, we do not understand their relationships with well-being.

Emerging body of work to answer this.

Looking for both positives and negatives in DIVIDED intellectual communities.

→ **Review the state of the literature, outline progress, gaps and potential future directions.**

Protected Areas and Human Well Being

Methods

Literature Reviews

Park Evaluation Literature

Designed Studies

Methodological Literature

Individual Studies

Key Generalisations

Methods

- WoS/Google Scholar search for “social impact” and “protected area”
- Publications which cite early key papers
- Trawled 11 key journals since 2005
- Email listserves (E-Anth, PCLG) and individuals
- Include ICCAs

Literature Reviews

- West et al (2006)
 - PAs as agents of social and natural change
 - Fortune/misfortune re-distributed along gender/ethnic/etc lines
 - Importance of wider political economy
- Coad et al
 - Different forms of fortune/misfortune
- Adams and Hutton (2007)
 - PA benefits "tend to reproduce existing economic inequalities within local communities and wider society" (p160)

Specific literature reviews

- Brockington and Igoe (2006) on evictions
 - Found poor quality data
 - 184 PAs worldwide (an underestimate?)
 - Must be understood in frame of national scale debates
 - What about more mundane effects?
- Maschia et al (forthcoming) Marine PAs
 - Declines in catch rare

Protected area management effectiveness evaluations

- Largest dataset in terms of pa numbers
- Can be collated and recoded for generalities (Leverington et al, 2008)
- Dudley et al (2008) *Safety Net*

'For all these studies there was an average score of 6.4 out of a possible 10. ..

The majority - nearly 75% of assessments - reported that the protected area had an acceptable to positive effect on the local community. ..

Only 5 per cent of responses scored less than 2.5 out of 10.'

Dudley et al 2008: 62

Problems with these studies

- Communities are aggregated, but household-scale variations are vital
- Assessments are rapid, and (almost exclusively) answered by PA managers
- Questions generally ask about legal, economic benefits, not about drawbacks
- An unwillingness to engage with negative social impacts?

4

SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPORTANCE

- | y | m/y | m/n | n | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|--|
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | a) The PA is an important source of employment for local communities. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | b) Local communities depend upon the PA resources for their subsistence. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | c) The PA provides community development opportunities through sustainable resource use. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | d) The PA has religious or spiritual significance. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | e) The PA has unusual features of aesthetic importance. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | f) The PA contains plant species of high social, cultural, or economic importance. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | g) The PA contains animal species of high social, cultural, or economic importance. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | h) The PA has a high recreational value. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | i) The PA contributes significant ecosystem services and benefits to communities. |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | j) The PA has a high educational and/or scientific value. |

Designed global research

- Upton et al (2009) - impacts of PAs are local, not national
- De Sherbinen (2009) - infant mortality no different around PAs
- Wittemyer (2009) - used population data in the wrong way
- **These papers lack recognition of political and economic context of PAs**

- Nelson and Agrawal on community wildlife management in Southern Africa
 - Failure to bring benefits shaped by political economy of wildlife
 - Particularly unwillingness of states to decentralise
- Ribot et al. Devolution of power over natural resources
 - Often incomplete or half-hearted
 - Vulnerable to elite capture
 - Rarely really tried

Designed field work

- WCS "living landscapes" in Gabon
 - Household surveys, focus groups, with control sites
 - Measures access to resources, wealth, nutritional status, social capital and social inequality
- CARE/WWF (and others) Albertine Rift
 - Focus groups and household surveys
 - Shows ethnic/gender differences in relations to PAs

Individual field studies

- Evictions in Central Africa
 - Contested figures
 - Eviction vs. economic displacement?
- PAs as offering inclusion
 - Some provide opportunities for livelihoods and identities to be retained

- Displacement/relocation from Indian PAs
 - Some great research
 - Often relocated people negotiate a good deal with the state
 - Role of new Forest Rights Act
 - Active NGO monitoring and lobbying
 - Relatively decentralised democracy
- Social relations and cultural norms
 - Social ties to guards prevents resistance, leading to displacement
 - No social ties allows resistance, lessening social impacts

Consistent themes

- Overall data quality poor but improving
 - Geographical and thematic lacunae
- Conceptual frameworks poor
 - Neglect household scale variations
- Wider political/economic factors neglected
- Vital that PAs are seen as agents for social/natural change
- PAs distribute fortune and misfortune
- Still a need effectively to engage with PAs problems